Process for:

Instructional Program Review

Cleveland Community College
2009-2010

Submitted to: Dr. L. Steve Thornburg
Submitted by: Duane A. Rominger
Date: July 11, 2007; Updated: August, 2008; July, 2009
ANNUAL PROGRAM REVIEW
Instructional Programs
Cleveland Community College
2009-2010

Procedures for Annual Review:

1. One person is NOT to do the entire annual review by him/herself. This is not an academic exercise but instead designed to be a program faculty’s in-depth evaluation of how well they are delivering programs and services. All program faculty must be involved—both full-time and adjunct. It is recommended that the program begin with a brief faculty meeting or retreat to discuss and divide tasks.

2. All programs must use at least one external committee (ad-hoc or standing advisory groups are fine) to provide feedback to programs.

3. All programs must utilize feedback from current students (and former students, if possible.)

4. The final product should be in the following format:

   • Cover Page including division, program and author(s) (prepared by)
   • Times New Roman, 12 font (entire document)
   • Three-hole punched and placed in a 1” three-ring binder with front sleeve (clear cover where a page can be inserted). The cover page should include: 1) the college name 2) the name of the program being reviewed, and 3) the year of the review (e.g. 2009-2010)

5. Do not include the following in the notebook for annual review:

   • copies of all your course syllabi or catalog copy
   • copies of faculty diplomas or other faculty credentials
   • printouts of data elements from IIPS or Colleague
   • copies of course rosters
   • names, addresses and phone number of all your students
   • the actual surveys you had returned (from 200 students)
   • anything else not asked for specifically in the document
6. In order to keep on track, the following should be completed by these *approximate* dates (2009-10 academic year):

- **July, 2009** Initial Training on Learning Outcomes
- **September, 2009** Further training on Program Review Procedures and Learning Outcomes
- **October 15, 2009** Final design of a one page survey to obtain data from current students is completed
- **October 30** Draft of Section I (digital copy only, sent to Duane A. Rominger)
- **October 30** Survey packets submitted to department heads by Planning and Research. Surveys deployed to students during the next ten days.  
  **February 28, 2010** Completed Surveys returned to Director of IE for analysis.
- **November 15** Draft of Section II completed (digital copy only, sent to Duane A. Rominger)
- **February 28, 2010** Draft of Section V, Future Issues—Resources Needed for Future Efforts
- **March 15, 2:00 PM** Group Meeting to discuss Sections I and II (Meeting Room TBA)
- **March 30** Draft of Section III, Student Outcomes (digital copy only, sent to Duane A. Rominger)
- **April 15** Draft of Section IV - Strengths, weaknesses and recommendations (digital copy only, sent to Duane A. Rominger)
- **April 22, 2:00 PM** Group meeting to discuss Sections III and IV (Meeting Room TBA)
- **May 15** Complete digital draft of final report due to Director of IE
May 31, 2010  Final document due to Vice-President for Instruction

Note: It is vitally important that faculty and staff see that budget requests resulting from program reviews are taken seriously and become an important factor in rational budgeting decisions by the administration of Cleveland Community College. I cannot stress enough the importance of this. It closes the loop and signals the College’s commitment to the program review process.
The following is a brief outline of the process for annual review. Following the outline is a full in-depth description of each section.

Outline: Instructional Program Review

I. The Program Profile

A. The Mission/Purpose

1. College mission
2. Program goals (administrative objectives and student learning outcomes) as they relate to the college’s mission

B. The Faculty

1. Faculty credentials (full and part-time)
2. Accomplishments of faculty
3. Professional development activities of faculty

C. The Students

1. Breakdown of students by type
2. Specific programs that require your courses
3. Numbers served, FTE, registrations, graduates
4. Demographic information on students
5. Trends
6. Funds received to serve the under-served

II. Program Content

A. Definition of the program

1. For whom is it intended
2. Criteria for admission to program (if any)

B. Curriculum or coursework

1. Service courses for general education core
2. Stand-alone programs
3. Degrees, certificates, diplomas
4. Other

C. External accreditation (if applicable) - the process, what is involved and status

D. Innovations, new programs, new courses, state-wide or national efforts, diversity applied to curriculum

E. Testing and remedial coursework

F. Distance education offerings and use of technology (include evaluation of efforts)

G. Funding for curricular changes or offerings

III. Measuring Outcomes

A. Process of identifying outcomes

B. Administrative Outcomes

C. Program Outcomes

D. Student Learning Outcomes: (specific to coursework or program area)

Examples:
1. Job placement
2. Transfers
3. Knowledge and skills
4. Improved condition
5. Values practiced
6. Completion rates and retention rates
7. End-of-course test scores
8. Critical success factors, licensure
9. Other
E. Follow-up of students we serve
F. Results of Outcome Measurement

IV. Need for Change

A. Strengths identified by external sources (advisory committees, most common employers of our students, employer's surveys, etc.) and students
B. Weaknesses identified by external sources and students
C. Recommendations by program staff to improve the program
D. Strategies for change (based on student/employer follow-up) - closing the loop.
E. A one-year follow-up brief report to the VP for Instruction reporting on the progress of E above (due April 15, the year following the program review).

V. Future Issues - Resources needed for future efforts

A. Anticipated future curricular changes and needs (based on market trends)
B. Market trends within the program area
C. Equipment, space and faculty needs for future growth or continuation
D. Future plans

Annual Program Review

The purpose of Annual Program Review is for instructional units to perform an internal review of the programs and services they are offering to students. The purpose of this review is to make sure that course content and methodology are meeting the needs of both the students and the community. All faculty members within the unit are to be involved in the review process. At least one external advisory group and some students should also be involved. Programs are selected each year by the Vice President for Instruction to be reviewed and all programs will eventually rotate on a five-year schedule.
Definition of a “Program”:

The term “Program” is loosely defined for the purpose of review. We will operationally define a “program” as:

“A group of courses, services or activities designed and implemented by a specific group of people with a common purpose or core set of outcomes.”

A program can be a degree-granting entity, a group of courses that lead to “adequate training” in an area, an instructional service delivery area of the college (such as some of the non-occupational courses offered through Continuing Education), or the College Bookstore.

Description of the Process:

I. Program Profile

A. Mission/Purpose

Each unit will have an opportunity to describe their program in some detail. All programs should fit nicely into the Mission of Cleveland Community College. Most programs don't have a separate mission except for areas that must be accredited such as Nursing, Engineering, etc. These programs are often required to have a “department” or “program” mission. If your program has a mission, you may use it here. But if it does not have a mission separate from the College, do not take the time and energy to create one, instead, simply address how your unit's goals fall in line with the College's mission and goals. Goals must always lead back to the mission. If they do not, red flags go up in the minds of those reading your review. All units must link to the college's mission.

B. Faculty

Since “lifelong learning” is a goal of the college and since 20 hours of professional development are strongly recommended for all faculty/staff, this would be a good opportunity to discuss the following:

- The credentials of all full and part-time faculty: degrees, special training, certificates, etc.
- The accomplishments of the faculty: grants, recognition, awards, fellowships, community service, etc.
- Professional Development activities of the faculty: courses taken, special training received, conferences attended, etc.
C. The Students

It is important to discuss the type of student that your program serves. Many programs serve only one type of students…. e.g. Physical Therapy students must be admitted to the program and the program serves no non-majors. Therefore their students are all declared majors. They have a certain GPA and set of prerequisites to enter the program. Other programs serve a diverse group of students. The following are suggested (not an exhaustive list):

The Office of Planning and Institutional Effectiveness will provide the following for you in a table you can upload into your document (by program code or core set of course numbers):

- Headcount, majors or FTE by term (last 5 years)
- Demographic information on students (race, gender, age)
- Degrees/certificates/diplomas awarded

Other information you may want to include (from your records)

- Other programs that require your courses
- Noticeable trends in enrollment
- Funds received to serve students previously not served

An explanation of any of the above would be welcome if an understanding can be reached as to why certain trends have occurred. The important issue here is that programs have an understanding of who they serve and how characteristics of those they serve impact programs (offerings, outcomes, etc.)

II. The Program

Here units can define their “program.” Some will be degree-granting programs and others will be a set of courses taken for training purposes or as core courses toward general education. Programs have freedom to explain themselves in terms of “function.”
A. Definition of the program

B. Curriculum or coursework - this has more to do with the department/program's offerings. Some items that might be included are:

- Service courses for general education core
- Stand-alone programs (set of courses that don't lead to a degree)
- Degrees, certificates, diplomas
- Other

C. External accreditation - the process, what is involved and status

- Accreditation by whom and the process

D. Innovations, new programs, new courses, state-wide or national efforts, diversity applied to curriculum

- The application of diversity to the curriculum
- Curricular changes (innovations, new courses, recognized efforts)

E. Testing and remedial coursework

E. Distance education offerings and use of technology (include evaluation of efforts)

- Expanded use of technology in the classroom

F. Funding for curricular changes or offerings

- Funds received to meet curricular needs

III. Student Learning Outcomes (each program should identify 2-3 student learning outcomes, only)

Education has moved into the age of assessment. We can no longer evaluate the effectiveness of our programs by FTE and numbers served. Our system office, accrediting agencies and government officials are interested in the outcomes our students see as a result of attending Cleveland Community College.

Very Important Note: It is no longer good enough that we offer programs; we must show that we are continually seeking to improve the content and methodology of those programs to better meet the changing needs of our students and the community. Many states have gone to performance-based funding to force colleges and universities to assess how effectively they are meeting student outcome objectives.
“Student Outcomes” are benefits for students: changes in knowledge, values, position, skills, behavior or status. More simply stated, outcomes are typically what faculty hope students achieve once they complete a program or set of courses (e.g. ability to orally communicate, pass the state nursing licensure exam, and get a job in a related field).

In this section, **you must**:

1. Identify administrative, program and student learning outcomes for your program (no more than 3-5)
2. Identify what assessment you will use to measure progress on that outcome (for example, the State Nursing Board exam results)
3. Identify what constitutes success on that measure (e.g., 80% passing rate)
4. Use of results to improve programs (Once you receive the data from your assessment - what are going to do with it?)

Attached is a form (Form A) for programs to use to identify and track outcome data.

**Operationally Defining the Different Types of Outcomes**

- **Learning Outcomes**:

  What changes in knowledge, skills, attitude, awareness, condition, and position (etc.) occur as a result of the learning that takes place in the classroom? These are direct benefits to students.

  Examples: general learning skills (e.g. improved writing and speaking abilities), ability to apply learning to the work environment (e.g. demonstrate skills in co-op), program-specific skills developed or enhanced (e.g. take blood pressure.)

- **Program Outcomes**:

  What are the benefits that result from the completion of an entire program or series of courses? Are there benefits for students who get the AAS in welding versus those who take just a few courses? If so what are they?

  Typical examples are: licensure pass rates, employment rates, acceptance into 4-year schools, lifelong learning issues, contributions to society, the profession, etc.)

- **Administrative Outcomes**

  These are outcomes established by programs and services that have nothing to do with student learning or completion of programs.

  They have to do with benefits to the faculty/staff, the department and to the college.
The English Department wants all faculty members to attend one professional meeting annually so they can stay up-to-date in their field. What are the benefits to the faculty, the college, and the students?

Counseling may want students to lose few credits when they transfer or to recruit a new counselor with expertise in working with first-generation students (huge population for us). What are the benefits to the counseling department, the college and students?

Facilities services may want all college units to feel that they respond quickly to maintenance needs and security issues. It they do this, what are the benefits to the college and to students?

What outcomes “are not”:

- Inputs or Activities
- Grades from courses
- A list of the 400 learning objectives from the syllabi (don't include copies of your syllabi as proof)
- Program outputs (Headcount, FTE, assigned Seats, number of graduates, etc.)

There are several steps involved in measuring student outcomes:

A. **Identifying outcomes**: Ways to identify outcomes are as follows:

- Use an advisory committee that understands the benefits students achieve as a result of your program.
- Use some focus groups of former graduates or completers to get information as to the benefits students have received as a result of your program.
- Look at the syllabi of instructors to see what instructors as a whole expect students to achieve through coursework.
- Look at the literature in your field.
- Check with other schools with similar programs to see how they have assessed outcomes.

B. Some programs may also want to identify Administrative Outcomes which are objectives set by the program faculty/staff but don't necessarily have to do with student learning. If you choose to set objectives, set no more than 2-3. Examples of administrative objectives would be:

- To apply for and receive accreditation from ?????
• To retrain two faculty members in the area of (something needed for your program)
• To increase the number of students completing courses by 10%

C. Program for which degrees or certificates are awarded will measure program outcomes. These outcomes are benefits for students as a result of receiving the entire program or set of courses.

Specific Program Outcomes may have to do with some of these examples:

• Job placement rates
• Transfers to 4-year programs
• Knowledge/skills achieved that make one successful in the field
• Improved condition
• Values practiced
• Completion rates and retention rates
• End-of-course test scores
• Critical success factors, licensure exam scores
• Lifelong learning indicators
• Professional service and participation

C. There are two categories of student learning outcomes: General education related (reading, writing, computational skills, etc.) and specific program outcomes (taking blood pressure in Nursing, etc.). Cleveland Community College’s General Education goals are in the catalog.

D. Follow-up of the students we serve

Create a method of regularly assessing outcomes. Some typical methods are as follows:

• Pre and post-test students upon entry and exit from a program
• Include a program survey in the general follow-up surveys of graduates and employers conducted by the Planning office
• Use focus groups
• Use archival data (credentialing boards, state exams)
• Surveys and feedback from graduates
• Surveys and feedback from completers
• Surveys and feedback from current students
• External feedback - advisory committee members, employers of graduates, supervisors of internships, clinical and apprenticeship work

E. Results of the Measurement of Administrative, Program and Student Learning Outcomes

• Identify what your outcomes results were and if your expectations were met or not met.

IV. Need for Change based on Student and Employer Feedback

Using outcome assessment results to improve programs and services is the most important aspect of annual review. By assessing outcomes, programs often find that students are not doing well in certain areas or that changes need to be made to keep up with trends in the field. Finding program weaknesses or need for change is a “good thing”. This gives a program direction for making changes and the ability to document the effort taken to make program improvements (true institutional effectiveness). Results from measuring student outcomes should be used in this section.

Most programs in higher education feel strongly that they are offering a good program that is state-of-the-art in their field. Often this is not true and programs would benefit in taking a frequent inventory of program effectiveness, strengths and weaknesses and make regular feedback part of their planning process. Students and employers are excellent sources of perceived program strengths and weaknesses. Five sections that must be included are:

1. Strengths identified by students and employers
2. Weaknesses identified by students and employers
3. Recommendations and strategies for change
4. Strategies for change - ways to better serve out students
5. A one-year follow-up on strategies for change

Accrediting agencies want colleges to “close the loop” or use feedback to improve programs. Programs often claim “on paper” to use student feedback to make programmatic changes but evidence of those changes is never recognized. This is why section IV, 5 is now being included in the required portion of the review process.

Programs that are reviewed in a given year will be required to submit a brief document in the spring of the following year identifying all the programmatic changes made as a result of assessing student outcomes the previous year during their annual review.
V. Future Issues (not needs for change)

This is an opportunity for programs to discuss what they will need for future growth, where their program is going, or anticipated future changes. Resources needed for future efforts can be discussed here. Some other issues that can be discussed are:

- Anticipated future curricular changes and needs - this may include the development of new courses or a new emphasis track.
- Market trends within the program area
- Equipment, space and faculty needs for future growth or continuation
- Future plan
Form A
Cleveland Community College Outcomes Worksheet

(Program/Unit)________________________________________________________________ (Degrees/certif. available)________________________________________________________________

(Assessment Period Covered)____________________________________________________________ (Date Submitted)____________________________

Description of Students Served:
What are the Basic Demographics of the Students Served?

Source for Identifying Student Learning and Program Outcomes
Who did you consult/contact to determine outcomes for your program area?

Intended Learning Outcome 1:

Means of Assessment for Learning Outcome 1:
Means of Program Assessment & Criteria for Success:

Intended Learning Outcome 2:
Means of Assessment for Learning Outcome 2:
Means of Program Assessment & Criteria for Success:

Intended Learning Outcome 3:

Means of Assessment for Learning Outcome 3:
Means of Program Assessment & Criteria for Success:

Intended Program Outcome 1:

Means of Assessment for Program Outcome 1:
Means of Program Assessment & Criteria for Success:

Intended Program Outcome 2:

Means of Assessment for Program Outcome 2:
Means of Program Assessment & Criteria for Success:

Intended Program Outcome 3:
Means of Assessment for Program Outcome 3:
Means of Program Assessment & Criteria for Success: